

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 9 December 2022 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Monday, 5 December 2022.

Present: County Councillor Hinchey (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Brown-Reckless, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jones, K Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Lloyd Jones, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Molik, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Jackie Parry, Reid-Jones, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Lynda Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong and Wood

58 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillors Bridgeman, Lay, Melbourne, Taylor, Robinson

59 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations were made:

COUNCILLOR	AGENDA ITEM NO	NATURE OF INTEREST
Councillor Mackie	3 Notice of Motion	Personal Interest Friend of St David's Hall.
Councillor Thomson	3 Notice of Motion	Personal Interest. Project work for the Royal College of Music and Drama.

C754626

60 : NOTICE OF MOTION

The Lord Mayor noted that a Notice of Motion proposed by Councillor Shimmin and seconded by Councillor Berman had been received for consideration. Two Amendments had been received.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Shimmin to propose the motion as follows:

This Council notes with alarm the speed at which the Cabinet may be moving towards a decision to change the ownership and/or management of the city's St

David's Hall, regarded by many as the national concert hall of Wales, and before any such decision is taken demands that:

- 1) A full business case is published by the Cabinet demonstrating why it considers the proposals would be of benefit to the community of Cardiff and the wider nation;
- 2) the Cabinet demonstrates how any such proposal would preserve the city's cultural heritage by providing all necessary safeguards that the Hall's current cultural and classical output would be preserved at current levels or greater, that the current provision for community events would be maintained, and that the well-recognised excellent acoustics of the Hall would be unaffected by any proposed structural alterations or proposals to remove existing seating;
- 3) a full and meaningful consultation is undertaken with the public and key stakeholders on the merits of the proposals, and the outcome of this consultation is given due and proper consideration; and
- 4) all alternative avenues to secure the funding necessary to maintain the building and clear the current maintenance backlog are fully explored – including asking the Welsh Government to provide financial assistance to secure the future of our publicly owned and operated national concert hall.

If, after taking these steps, the Cabinet still determines it is minded to proceed with changing the ownership and/or management of St David's Hall, then this Council calls for that to be achieved through an open tendering process which could ensure the best available option can be considered, subject to appropriate safeguards being able to be met.

The Motion was formally seconded by Councillor Berman.

The Lord Mayor called upon Councillor Robson to move the first amendment as follows:

Delete everything after the first paragraph and add the following:

All alternative avenues to secure the funding necessary to keep this building under public ownership are fully and transparently explored – including firstly asking the Welsh Government to consider taking on the ownership of this national building.

If, after taking these steps, the Cabinet still determines it is minded to proceed with changing the ownership and/or management of St David's Hall, then this Council calls for that to be achieved through an open tendering process to include;

- 1) A full business case, published by the Cabinet demonstrating why it considers the proposals would be of benefit to the community of Cardiff and the wider nation;
 - 2) the Cabinet demonstrating how any such proposal would preserve the city's cultural heritage by providing safeguards that the Hall's current cultural and classical output and community events would be preserved at current levels or greater, and that the well-recognised excellent acoustics of the Hall would be unaffected by any proposed structural alterations or proposals to remove
- This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

existing seating. A fund should also be established to assist with hiring costs to support the ongoing community events.

- 3) A full and meaningful consultation is undertaken with the public and key stakeholders on the merits of the proposals, and the outcome of this consultation is given due and proper consideration.

The Amended Motion would read:

This Council notes with alarm the speed at which the Cabinet may be moving towards a decision to change the ownership and/or management of the city's St David's Hall, regarded by many as the national concert hall of Wales, and before any such decision is taken demands that:

All alternative avenues to secure the funding necessary to keep this building under public ownership are fully and transparently explored – including firstly asking the Welsh Government to consider taking on the ownership of this national building.

If, after taking these steps, the Cabinet still determines it is minded to proceed with changing the ownership and/or management of St David's Hall, then this Council calls for that to be achieved through an open tendering process to include;

- 1) A full business case, published by the Cabinet demonstrating why it considers the proposals would be of benefit to the community of Cardiff and the wider nation;
- 2) the Cabinet demonstrating how any such proposal would preserve the city's cultural heritage by providing safeguards that the Hall's current cultural and classical output and community events would be preserved at current levels or greater, and that the well-recognised excellent acoustics of the Hall would be unaffected by any proposed structural alterations or proposals to remove existing seating. A fund should also be established to assist with hiring costs to support the ongoing community events.
- 3) A full and meaningful consultation is undertaken with the public and key stakeholders on the merits of the proposals, and the outcome of this consultation is given due and proper consideration.

The Motion was formally seconded by Councillor Joel Williams.

The Lord Mayor called upon Councillor Burke-Davies to move the second amendment as follows:

This Council notes **that it has been the confirmed policy of the Council since 2014 to pursue Alternative Service Delivery arrangements for St David's Hall, due to funding pressures arising from the austerity policies of the then Coalition Government.**

It further notes that in 2016 the Council undertook a detailed Competitive Dialogue tender process for an alternative service delivery method for St David's Hall, and

notes the process concluded unsuccessfully with no tenders received that could deliver the Classical Programme and remove the Council's liability for the building.

~~with alarm the speed at which the Cabinet may be moving towards a decision to change the ownership and/or management of the city's St David's Hall, regarded by many as the national concert hall of Wales, and before any such decision is taken demands that:~~

The Council calls on Cabinet to ensure that before making this decision it gives due consideration to:

- ~~1. a full business case is published by the Cabinet demonstrating why it considers the proposals would be of benefit to the community of Cardiff and the wider nation; and~~
- ~~2. the Cabinet demonstrates how any such~~ the proposal would preserve the city's cultural heritage by providing all necessary safeguards that the Hall's current cultural and classical output would be preserved at current levels or greater, that the current provision for community events would be maintained, and that the well-recognised excellent acoustics of the Hall would be unaffected by any proposed structural alterations or proposals to remove existing seatings; ~~noting that the proposals have been tested with the Hall's original acoustic engineers;~~

The Council notes that proposals will also be subject to Consultation via the Budget process, building in turn on repeated consultation exercises over the last 8 years, prior to the Cabinet taking the final decision on the matter.

The Council recognises that identifying alternative public avenues of funding is unlikely, with the Arts Council having withdrawn its revenue funding for St David's Hall in 2014 and Welsh Government facing severe funding pressures, but calls upon Cabinet to consider any alternative sources of public funding.

- ~~3. a full and meaningful consultation is undertaken with the public and key stakeholders on the merits of the proposals, and the outcome of this consultation is given due and proper consideration; and~~
- ~~4. all alternative avenues to secure the funding necessary to maintain the building and clear the current maintenance backlog are fully explored – including asking the Welsh Government to provide financial assistance to secure the future of our publicly owned and operated national concert hall.~~

~~If, after taking these steps, the Cabinet still ultimately determines it is minded to proceed with changing the ownership and/or management of St David's Hall, then this Council calls for that to be achieved through an open tendering process which could ensure the best available option can be considered, subject to appropriate safeguards being able to be met.~~ notes that Cabinet will obtain the relevant technical advice on the process to be followed, as is standard procedure for decisions of this nature.

Finally the Council notes that Cabinet's decision will be subject to the usually scrutiny process under the Council's scrutiny procedure rules.

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

The Amended Motion would read:

This Council notes that it has been the confirmed policy of the Council since 2014 to pursue Alternative Service Delivery arrangements for St David's Hall, due to funding pressures arising from the austerity policies of the then Coalition Government.

It further notes that in 2016 the Council undertook a detailed Competitive Dialogue tender process for an alternative service delivery method for St David's Hall, and notes the process concluded unsuccessfully with no tenders received that could deliver the Classical Programme and remove the Council's liability for the building.

The Council calls on Cabinet to ensure that before making this decision it gives due consideration to:

1. a business case demonstrating why it considers the proposals would be of benefit to the community of Cardiff and the wider nation; and
2. how the proposal preserves the city's cultural heritage by providing safeguards that the Hall's current cultural and classical output would be preserved at current levels or greater, that the current provision for community events would be maintained, and that the well-recognised excellent acoustics of the Hall would be unaffected by any proposed structural alterations or proposals to remove existing seating, noting that the proposals have been tested with the Hall's original acoustic engineers;

The Council notes that proposals will also be subject to Consultation via the Budget process, building in turn on repeated consultation exercises over the last 8 years, prior to the Cabinet taking the final decision on the matter.

The Council recognises that identifying alternative public avenues of funding is unlikely, with the Arts Council having withdrawn its revenue funding for St David's Hall in 2014 and Welsh Government facing severe funding pressures, but calls upon Cabinet to consider any alternative sources of public funding.

If Cabinet ultimately determines it is minded to proceed with changing the ownership and/or management of St David's Hall, then this Council notes that Cabinet will obtain the relevant technical advice on the process to be followed, as is standard procedure for decisions of this nature.

-

Finally the Council notes that Cabinet's decision will be subject to the usual scrutiny process under the Council's scrutiny procedure rules.

The amendment was formally seconded by Councillor Huw Thomas.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the motion and amendments.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Shimmin to respond to the issues raised during the debate.

Councillor Shimmin responded to the issues raised and confirmed the Amendments were not accepted.

The Lord Mayor called for a Vote on the First Amendment as moved by Councillor Robson and seconded by Councillor Joel Williams.

FOR

Brown-Reckless, Cowan, Calum Davies, Driscoll, Gibson, Lancaster, Littlechild, Owen, Reid Jones, Robson, Williams

AGAINST

Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Burke-Davies, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hopkins, Hunphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd-Jones, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Mackie, Michael, Molik, Moultrie, Naughton, Palmer, Parry, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Wong, Wood.

The vote on the amendment was LOST.

The Lord Mayor called for a Vote on the Second Amendment as moved by Councillor Burke-Davies and seconded by Councillor Huw Thomas.

FOR

Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Burke-Davies, Carr, Chowdhury, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hunphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd-Jones, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Mackie, Michael, Moultrie, Palmer, Parry, Sangani, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver, Wild, Wong.

AGAINST

Brown-Reckless, Carter, Cowan, Calum Davies, Driscoll, Gibson, Hopkins Lancaster, Latif, Littlechild, Molik, Naughton, Owen, Reid Jones, Robson, Shimmin, Waldron, Williams, Wood.

The vote on the amendment was CARRIED.

The Lord Mayor invited Councillor Burke-Davies to respond before a vote was taken on the Substantive Motion as amended.

The Lord Mayor called for a Vote on the Substantive Motion as amended.

FOR

Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Burke-Davies, Carr, Chowdhury, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hunphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd-Jones, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Mackie, Michael, Moultrie, Palmer, Parry, Sangani, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver, Wild, Wong.

AGAINST

Carter, Hopkins, Kaaba, Latif, Molik, Naughton, Shimmin, Waldron, Wood.

ABSTAIN

Cowan, Calum Davies, Driscoll, Gibson, Lancaster, Littlechild, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson, Williams.

The Substantive Motion as amended was CARRIED.